

EVIL AND/OR COMPROMISE SITUATIONS IN MORAL THEOLOGY

Compiled by

James T. Bretzke, S.J.
jbretzke@jesuits.org

Last update: October 31, 2018

URL:<https://www2.bc.edu/james-bretzke/EvilAndCompromiseInMoralTheologyBibliography.pdf>

For more titles in related areas of moral theology see James T. Bretzke, S.J., *A Research Bibliography in Christian Ethics and Catholic Moral Theology*, (Lewiston NY: Edwin Mellen Press, 2006).

See also my *Natural Law Bibliography* <https://www2.bc.edu/james-bretzke/NaturalLawBibliographyByBretzke.pdf>

Table of Contents

<i>Theological/Philosophical Problem of Evil (Theodicy)</i>	1
<i>Intrinsece Malum (Intrinsic Evil) and/or Ontic Evil</i>	6
<i>Compromise, Cooperation, Double Effect, Minus Malum, Principle of Tolerance, etc.</i>	11
<i>Proportionalism</i>	18

EVIL AND/OR CONFLICT SITUATIONS IN MORAL THEOLOGY

Compiled by

James T. Bretzke, S.J.

For more titles in related areas of moral theology see James T. Bretzke, S.J., *A Research Bibliography in Christian Ethics and Catholic Moral Theology*, (Lewiston NY: Edwin Mellen Press, 2006).

Theological/Philosophical Problem of Evil (Theodicy)

Adams, Marilyn McCord and Robert Merrihew Adams, eds. The Problem of Evil. New York: Oxford University Press, 1990.

Essays by J.L. Mackie, Nelson Pike, Roderick M. Chisholm, terence Penelhum, Alvin Plantinga, William L. Rowe, Stephen J. Wykstra, John Hick, and Diogenes Allen.

Reviewed by William Hasker in Ethics 103 (1992): 206.

Al-Ghazali, Muhammad. "The Problem of Evil From Islamic Perspective." Dialogue & Alliance 8 (2/1994): 65-74.

Cahill, Lisa Sowle. "Euthanasia: The Practical and Social Significance of Double Effect." In *Method and Catholic Moral Theology: The Ongoing Reconstruction*, 237-259. Edited by Todd A. Salzman. Omaha: Creighton University Press, 1999.

Cenkner, William. "The Understanding of Evil in Modern Hindu Thought." Dialogue & Alliance 8 (2/1994): 26-35.

Crenshaw, James L., ed. Theodicy in the Old Testament. Issues in Religion and Theology, 4. Philadelphia: Fortress Press; London: SPCK, 1983.

An introduction plus 8 articles ranging from A.S. Peake's 1905 essay on Job to Crenshaw's own 1975 treatment on the problem of human bondage in Sirach. Other contributors include Walther Eichrodt, Ronald J. Williams, Klaus Koch, Gerhard von Rad, Martin Buber, and Harmut Gese.

Dore, C. God, Suffering and Solipsim. Library of Philosophy and Religion. New York: Macmillan, 1989.

D'Sa, Xavier Francis. "Trinitarian Evil: The Bhagavadgita's Understanding of Evil." *Dialogue & Alliance* 8 (2/1994): 12-25.

Elizondo, Virgil. "Evil and the Experience of God." *The Way* 33 (1993): 34-43.

Flescher, Andrew Michael. *Moral Evil*. Moral Traditions Series. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 2013.

Flescher lays out the contours of his four dominant models in a helpful introductory chapter before turning to a detailed description of each in the first four chapters of his book. These models are 1) evil as the presence of badness as radical separate from goodness (e.g., Manicheanism), 2) evil as the presence of goodness, (e.g. theodicy), 3) evil as the absence of badness (a contrast to the good, e.g. perspectivalism), and finally his preferred model, 4) as what occurs in the the absence of goodness, (an Augustinian notion of privation). A fifth, concluding chapter joins the Augustinian notion of evil as privation to a neo-Aristotelian virtue ethics.

Reviewed by James T. Bretzke, S.J. in *Catholic Books Review: An Online Journal*

Flescher is a member of the Core Faculty, Program in Public Health, associate professor of preventive medicine, and associate professor of English at Stony Brook University.

Fuchs, Josef, S.J. "The «Sin of the World» and Normative Morality." *Gregorianum* 61 (1980): 51-76.

Also found as ch. 8, pp. 153-175, of Personal Responsibility and Christian Morality, trans. William Cleves, et. al., (Dublin: Gill and Macmillan, 1983).

Traduzione italiana: "Il «Peccato del Mondo» e la morale normativa." In Sussidi 1980 Per Lo Studio Della Teologia Morale Fondamentale, 415-435. (Per l'uso privato degli studenti). Roma: Pontificia Università Gregoriana, 1977, 1980.

Auf Deutsch: «Sünde der Welt» und normative Moral." In Anspruch der Wirklichkeit und christlicher Glaube: Probleme und Wege theologischer Ethik heute, 135-154. Hrsg. Helmut Weber und Dietmar Mieth. Düsseldorf: Patmos Verlag, 1980.

Josef Fuchs is professor emeritus of moral theology at the Pontifical Gregorian University in Rome.

Goldberg, David. "Divine Providence and The Problem of Evil in Jewish Thought." Dialogue & Alliance 8 (2/1994): 36-46.

Haas, Peter J. *Morality After Auschwitz: The Radical Challenge of the Nazi Ethic*. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1988.

Reviewed in *Gregorianum* by James T. Bretzke, S.J.

Haas is Associate Professor of Religious Studies at Vanderbilt.

Hallet, Garth L., S.J. "Evil and Human Understanding." The Heythrop Journal 32 (1991): 467-476.

Hauerwas, Stanley M. Naming the Silences: God, Medicine, and the Problem of Suffering. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1990.

Discusses religious aspects of suffering, the problem of evil, etc.

Hebblethwaite, Brian. "MacKinnon and the problem of evil." In Christ, Ethics, and Tragedy: Essays in Honour of Donald Mackinnon, 131-145. Edited by Kenneth Surin. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989.

Paper presented at a conference on the work of Donald MacKinnon, held at St. John's College, Cambridge, on 22-25 July 1986.

Highfield, Ronald. Barth and Rahner in Dialogue: Toward an Ecumenical Understanding of Sin and Evil. American University Studies: Series 7, Theology and Religion, 62. Frankfurt-am-Main, Bern, New York, Paris: Peter Lang, 1989.

Johnstone, Brian V., C.Ss.R. "Learning through Suffering: The Moral Meaning of Negative Experience." In Conscience: Studies in Honour of Seán O'Riordan, C.Ss.R., 144-160. Edited by Raphael Gallagher, C.Ss.R., and Brendan McConvery, C.Ss.R. Dublin: Gill and Macmillan, 1989.

Kekes, John. Facing Evil. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1990.

Arguing that the prevalence of evil presents a fundamental problem for our secular sensibility, Kekes develops a conception of character morality as a response. Kekes maintains that the main sources of evil are habitual, unchosen actions produced by our character defects and that we can increase our control over the evil we cause by cultivating a reflective temper. In addition to philosophical sources Kekes bases his arguments on the works of Sophocles, Shakespeare and Conrad.

MacDonald, Sebastian K. Moral Theology and Suffering. New York: Peter Lang Publishing, Inc, 1995.

Metz, Johannes Baptist, ed. "Moral Evil Under Challenge." Concilium 6 (1970). Series of articles on various aspects of evil, guilt, psychology, sin, and ethics.

Murphy, Nancy. "On the Priority of Personal to Structural Evil in Catholic Social Teaching: A Critique." Chapter 7 in Ethics, Religion, and the Good Society: New Direction in a Pluralistic World, 148-154. Edited by Joseph Runzo. Westminster: John Knox Press, 1992.

Niebuhr, H. Richard. [listed in order of publication]: "War as the Judgment of God." *Christian Century* 59 (1942): 630-633; "Is God in the War?" (With Virgil C. Aldrich) *Christian Century* 59 (1942): 953-955; and "War as Crucifixion" *Christian Century* 60 (1943): 513-515.

Three seminal articles outlining Niebuhr's moral interpretation of what God is doing in the Second World War.

Parkin, David, ed. *The Anthropology of Evil*. New York: Basil Blackwell, 1985.

Pavelich, Andrew. "The Moral Problem with the Free Will Defense Against the Problem of Evil." *Heythrop Journal* (May 8, 2107). DOI: 10.1111/heyj.12654

Begins by raising "a problem for many theists who say that God allows evil because free will is so valuable—the so-called 'Free Will Defense' (hereafter 'FWD') against the problem of evil. There have been many elaborations of the FWD, but I will argue that ultimately any such response fails to stand up to our intuitive notions of goodness. If a person acted as such theists say that God acts, we would not think of them as good. While theists can try to drive a wedge between the application of our normal standard of morality to people and to God, I will argue that there is no way to excuse God from moral responsibility for allowing evil." Pavelich then concludes that in "offering up any possible way of understanding why God allows evil, one must either maintain that God's morality is recognizable by human standards, or admit that it is not. That is, one must decide if claims about God being moral are literal or figurative. The FWD must take them literally, since otherwise there would be no reason for a theist to give the response—they would simply say that God's values are not ours and leave it at that. But if God is allowing evil in order to preserve absolute free will, then God really is valuing things very differently than we do; so differently that any claim that God is morally good seems unjustifiable."

At this writing Pavelich is an assistant professor of philosophy at the University of Houston.

Phan, Peter C. "Overcoming Poverty and Injustice: The Response of Liberation Theology to Evil." *Dialogue & Alliance* 8 (2/1994): 47-64.

Pinn, Anthony B. *Why, Lord?: Suffering and Evil in Black Theology*. New York: Continuum, 1995.

Piyaratana, Kongaswela. "The Concept of Evil In Buddhism." *Dialogue & Alliance* 8 (2/1994): 3-11.

Prusak, Bernard G. "Double Effect, All Over Again: The Case of Sister Margaret McBride." *Theoretical Medicine and Bioethics* 32/4 (2011): 271-283. (Online publication 20 May 2011 and available at <http://philpapers.org/rec/PRUDEA>).

Using the well-known 2009 "Phoenix 'Abortion' Case" Prusak re-examines the traditional text-book rendition of the 4 criteria of the principal of the double effect, and argues that from a philosophical perspective the criterion that "the evil effect in question may not be the means to the good effect" does not stand up to critical philosophical inquiry. Rather than do away entirely with PDE reasoning and casuistry, Prusak calls for a revision of the problematic criterion.

Prusak teaches at Villanova University.

Rigali, Norbert J., S.J. "Evil and Models of Christian Ethics." Horizons 8 (1981): 7-22.

Rigali teaches moral theology at the University of San Diego.

Schulweis, Harold M. Evil and the Morality of God. New York: KTAV Publishing House, 1984.

Reviewed by Charles M. Raffel in Journal of Religion 66 (1986): 452-454.

Tilley, Terrence. The Evils of Theodicy. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 1991.

_____. "The Use and Abuse of Theodicy." Horizons 11 (1984): 304-319.

Vicchio, Stephen J. The Voice from the Whirlwind: The Problem of Evil and the Modern World. Westminster (MD): Christian Classics, 1989.

A doctoral dissertation.

Reviewed by Martin R. Tripole, S.J. in Theological Studies 51 (1990): 763-764.

Whitney, Barry L. Evil and the Process God. Toronto Studies in Theology, 19. New York: E. Mellen Press, 1985.

_____. Theodicy: An Annotated Bibliography on the Problem of Evil, 1960--1990. Garland Reference Library of the Humanities, Volume 1111. New York: Garland, 1993.

_____. What Are They Saying About God and Evil? New York: Paulist Press, 1989.

Intrinsece Malum (Intrinsic Evil) and/or Ontic Evil

Billy, D.J., C.Ss.R. "Ontic Evil and Equivocation: Revising the Terms of the Discussion." Studia Moralia 30 (1992): 321-329.

Proposes a threefold categorization of *malum* of evil as a way of avoiding the problem of equivocation in the proportionalist use of the term "ontic evil." Billy grounds his terminology in an analogous understanding of evil plus a recognition of the tension between certain Thomistic and Personalist categories.

Bouscaren, T. Lincoln, S.J. *Ethics of Ectopic Operations*. 2nd ed. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1933, 1944.

Boyle, Patrick J., S.J. *Parvitas Materiae in Sexto in Contemporary Catholic Thought*. Lanham: University Press of America, 1987.

Presents an historical overview of the traditional teaching, followed by a consideration of contemporary objections to the teaching as well as a critical evaluation of both traditional and contemporary teachings on the parvity of matter in sexual sins. Good rehearsal of the issues involved pro and con on the existence of objective morality and intrinsic evil.

Bretzke, James T., S.J. "Debating Intrinsic Evil: Navigation between Shibboleth and Gauntlet" *Horizons* 41/1 (June 2014): 116-129.

Referencing Robert Schreiter's notion of philosophical and theological "intercultural" communication, this paper engages the Catholic moral tradition's conception of *intrinsece malum in se* and proposes a taxonomy of views taken both from this tradition and how the term has been referenced by the Magisterium in documents such as *Veritatis splendor* and episcopal pronouncements connected with some hot button moral issues. At times the expression "intrinsically evil" functions as a shibboleth that only partially succeeds in demonstrating Schreiter's "competence criteria of effectiveness and appropriateness," and at other times the term functions more as a gauntlet thrown down to sharpen sides in political policy debates. Hopefully the notion of the taxonomy of conceptions and uses of "intrinsic evil" may aid in more dispassionate ethical analysis and overcoming some of the divisions that either the shibboleth or gauntlet usages effect.

See the Response by Michael P. Jaycox "Debating 'Intrinsic Evil'" *Horizons* 41, no. 1 (2014): 142–65.

_____. "Intrinsic Evil in *Veritatis splendor*." Paper prepared for the Conference "The Concept of Intrinsic Evil in Catholic Theological Ethics." Theology Faculty of the University of Vienna, January 30-31, 2018. <https://www2.bc.edu/james-bretzke/BretzkePaperOnIntrinsicEvilInVeritatisSplendor.pdf>

_____. "Responsum ad Dubia: Harmonizing *Veritatis splendor* and *Amoris laetitia* through a Conscience-Informed Casuistry." *Journal of Catholic Social Thought* (Winter 2017).

The 5 *Dubia* of Cardinals Burke et al. on *Amoris laetitia* (AL) posits a supposed contradiction between *Veritatis splendor* (VS) on intrinsically evil acts and AL's position on pastoral discernment allowing for the possibility of a divorced/remarried individual to return to the Sacraments without an annulment or promising to live as "brother and

sister." A group of conservative theologians in a *Correctio Filialis De Haeresibus Propagatis* ("Filial Correction") also levelled serious charges that AL and Pope Francis himself are guilty of seven heresies. Certainly, AL does move beyond *Familiaris consortio* (FC#84) in allowing a person(s) living in *more uxorio* (1st *Dubium*). However, careful analysis of the relevant texts shows that Pope Francis has neither contradicted the moral tradition of the Church nor VS itself by envisioning such a practice (*Dubia* 2-5). Attention to a conscience-informed casuistry grounded in the teaching of *Gaudium et spes* and the *Catechism of the Catholic Church* (CCC), demonstrates that a proper *Responsum* to the *Dubia* and *Correctio Filialis* would be at best *Non liquet* (not proven).

Carlotti, Carlo. "L'intrinsece malum et la *Veritatis splendor*." In *Dvinarum rerum notitia. La teologia tra filosofia e storia. Studi in onore del Cardinale Walter Kasper*, 144-169. A cura di Antonio Russo e Gianfranco Coffele. Roma: Edizioni Studium, 2001.

Cloutier, David. "'Intrinsic Evil' & Public Policy: A Partisan Abuse of the Church's Moral Teachings." *Commonweal* Posted October, 2012 at <http://commonwealmagazine.org/%E2%80%98intrinsic-evil%E2%80%99-public-policy>

Dedek, John F. "Intrinsically Evil Acts: The Emergence of a Doctrine." *Recherches de theologie ancienne et medievale* 50 (1983): 191-226.

_____. "Intrinsically Evil Acts: An Historical Study of the Mind of St. Thomas." *The Thomist* 43 (1979): 385-413.

Demmer, Klaus, M.S.C. "Erwägungen zum *Intrinsece malum*." *Gregorianum* 68/3-4 (1987): 613-637.

At this writing Demmer was professor of moral theology at the Pontifical Gregorian University in Rome.

Dillon, Dana L. "Debating 'Intrinsic Evil'" *Horizons* 41, no. 1 (2014): 130–42.

See the Response by Michael P. Jaycox "Debating 'Intrinsic Evil'" *Horizons* 41, no. 1 (2014): 142–65.

Dillon is associated with the "New Wineskins" movement of Catholic moral theologians and teaches at Providence College.

Drane, James F. "Condoms, AIDS & Catholic Ethics: *Open to the Transmission of Death?*" *Commonweal* 118 (22 March 1991): 188-192.

Drane, a professor of clinical medical ethics at Edinboro University of Pennsylvania, shares difficulties on the application of the term "intrinsically evil" to any and all condom use. Drane suggests a more careful investigation of the moral issues involved, a full understanding of the natural law tradition, and the use of the principles of the double

effect and counseling the lesser evil would all lead to a conclusion that in certain cases condom use in marriage would be morally licit.

Foran, John E., M.D. "Ectopic Pregnancy: Current Treatment Options, *deju vu Humanae Vitae*." *Linacre Quarterly* 66 (February 1999): 21-28.

Very critical of removal of the fetus in ectopic pregnancies—calling it a “direct abortion” and asking for a strong condemnation of this practice by the CDF.

Fuchs, Josef, S.J. "Gibt es in sich schlechte Handlungen? Zum Problem des «Intrinsece malum»." *Stimmen der Zeit* 119 (1994): 291-304.

Fuchs is Professor Emeritus of Moral Theology at the Pontifical Gregorian University in Rome.

_____. "An Ongoing Discussion in Christian Ethics: «Intrinsically Evil Acts?»" Chapter 5 in Id. *Christian Ethics in a Secular Arena*, 71-90. Translated by Bernard Hoose and Brian McNeil. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, and Dublin: Gill and Macmillan, 1984.

Report presented at an international study week for moral theologians on the universality and immutability of moral norms, held in Rome in 1981, and later presented as a public lecture at the University of California, Berkeley in 1982. German text in *Sittliche Normen. Zum Problem ihrer allgemeinen und unwandelbaren Geltung*, 74-91. Edited by Walter Kerber. Düsseldorf: Patmos Verlag, 1982.

Hoose, Bernard. "Circumstances, Intentions and Intrinsically Evil Acts." In *The Splendor of Accuracy: An Examination of the Assertions Made by Veritatis Splendor*. 136-152. Edited by Joseph A. Selling and Jan Jans. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1994.

Looks at the claims made in the Encyclical regarding the absolute prohibition of “intrinsically evil acts,” and uses a number of historical examples to indicate how previous Popes either performed, ordered, or approved a whole range of actions which have subsequently been condemned by *Gaudium et spes* #27 (which passage is used to provide the list of “intrinsically evil acts” contained in *Veritatis Splendor* #80). Hoose also critiques the notion of “object” and intention and circumstances developed in the Encyclical as being too vaguely done, with the result that a simple reading of the text will lead to false conclusions about the nature of moral acts (at least in the Thomistic tradition).

Janssens, Louis. "Ontic Evil and Moral Evil." *Louvain Studies* 4 (1972): 115-156.

Also found in *Readings in Moral Theology, No. 1: Moral Norms and Catholic Tradition*, 40-93. Edited by Charles E. Curran and Richard A. McCormick, S.J. New York: Paulist Press, 1979.

Presents a careful reading of St. Thomas before moving on to developing the distinction between ontic evil and moral evil.

Jaycox, Michael P. "Debating 'Intrinsic Evil'" *Horizons* 41, no. 1 (2014): 142–65.

A Response to the articles of James Bretzke and Dana Dillon in the same volume.

Johnstone, Brian V., C.Ss.R. "Intrinsically Evil Acts." *Studia Moralia* 43 (2005): 379-406.

Kaveny, M. Cathleen. "Intrinsic Evil and Political Responsibility: Is the Concept of Intrinsic Evil Helpful to the Catholic Voter?" *America* (27 October 2008): 15-19.

Also found (with added Discussion Questions) as Chapter 8 in *Voting and Holiness: Catholic Perspectives on Political Participation*, 126-134. Edited by Nicholas P. Cafardi. New York/Mahwah: Paulist Press, 2012.

Knauer, Peter, S.J. "La détermination du bien et du mal par le principe du double effet." *Nouvelle Revue Theologique* 87 (1965): 356-376.

In English: "The Hermeneutic Function of the Principle of the Double Effect." In *Readings in Moral Theology, No. 1: Moral Norms and Catholic Tradition*, 1-39. Edited by Charles E. Curran and Richard A. McCormick, S.J. New York: Paulist Press, 1979.

Also found in English in *Natural Law Forum* 12 (1967): 132-162.

Auf Deutsch: "Das rechverstandene Prinzip von der Doppeltwirkung als Grundnorm jeder Gewissensentscheidung." *Theologie und Glaube* 57 (1967): 107-133.

The German and English versions are a slightly reworked presentation of the French article, responding to certain criticisms the latter had evoked. In many ways this article can be taken as the beginning of the modern proportionalist debate.

McCormick, Richard A., S.J., and Ramsey, Paul, eds. *Doing Evil to Achieve Good: Moral Choice in Conflict Situations*. Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1978.

Includes essays by Baruch Brody, William K. Frankena, Bruno Schüller, S.J., as well as contributions by Ramsey and McCormick, all of which deal in some way with McCormick's reformulation of the principle of the double effect, given as the 1973 Père Marquette Lecture, delivered at Marquette University in Milwaukee, Wisconsin (and which is included in this volume as well).

Melchin, Kenneth R. "Revisionists, Deontologists, and the Structure of Moral Understanding." *Theological Studies* 51 (1990): 389-416.

Discusses the recent debate over premoral norms, the direct/indirect distinction, exceptionless norms, intrinsic evil, and moral authority in terms of procedural criteria for

data selection, classification, and values-prioritization in the empirical methods of moral theology.

Author teaches moral theology at St. Paul University in Ottawa.

Murtagh, James. Intrinsic Evil: An Examination of This Concept and Its Place in Current Discussions on Absolute Moral Norms. Excerpta ex dissertatione ad Doctoratum in Facultate Theologiae Pontificae Universitatis Gregoriana. Roma, 1973. Dissertation done under Josef Fuchs, S.J.

Murtagh is a priest in Miami.

Pinckaers, Servais, O.P. *Ce qu'on ne peut jamais faire : la question des actes intrinsèquement mauvais, histoire et discussion*. Series: Etudes d'éthique chrétienne 19. Paris: Cerf, 1986.

This book was commissioned by the then Cardinal Prefect of the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, Joseph Ratzinger, and its printing costs were also underwritten by the same Congregation.

_____. "La question des actes intrinsèquement mauvais et le proportionalisme." *Revue Thomiste* 84 (1984): 618-624.

Porter, Jean. "The Moral Act in *Veritatis Splendor* and in Aquinas's *Summa Theologiae*: A Comparative Analysis." In *Veritatis Splendor: American Responses*, ed. Michael E. Allsopp and John J. O'Keefe, 278-95. Kansas City, M.O.: Sheed & Ward, 1995. Excellent article which carefully analyzes the exposition of the moral act in the Encyclical against the various pertinent texts of Thomas Aquinas. Porter concludes that in some critical areas the Encyclical is either misleading in its presumed interpretation of Thomas, or departs significantly from that tradition. The major area of difficulty concerns the interpretation given to "intrinsically evil acts" in the Encyclical.

Quay, Paul, S.J. "The Disvalue of Ontic Evil." *Theological Studies* 46 (1985): 262-286.

Quay, a professor of physics, is a strong critic of revised moral theology and proportionalism in particular.

Rhonheimer, Martin. "'Intrinsically Evil Acts' and the Moral Viewpoint: Clarifying a Central Teaching of *Veritatis Splendor*." *The Thomist* 58 (1994): 1-39.

The article's central purpose is to give an exposition of the notion of intrinsically evil acts in such a way as to deny theories of proportionalism. References to *Veritatis Splendor* are used in a rather proof-texting fashion.

Rhonheimer teaches at the Roman Athenaeum of the Holy Cross (Opus Dei).

Rigali, Norbert J., S.J. "Evil and Models of Christian Ethics." *Horizons* 8, no. 1 (1981): 7–22.

Selling, Joseph. "Regulating Fertility and Clarifying Moral Language." *Heythrop Journal* (2014).

Using the evolving Church teaching on the moral licitness of regulating fertility by married couples Selling outlines several differing modes of moral reasoning and analysis employed in the various teachings, and raises significant problems associated with an insufficiently nuanced understanding of terms such as "intrinsically evil/immoral." He illustrates his discussion by using examples from Augustine to John Paul II, and focuses especially on the development of moral reasoning from Pius XI's 1931 *Casti Connubii* to Pius XII's 1951 Address to the Italian Midwives, to Vatican II's 1965 *Gaudium et spes* and then on to Paul VI's 1968 *Humanae vitae* before concluding with John Paul II's employment of terms such as "culture of life" and "culture of death" in his 1995 *Evangelium vitae* and elsewhere.

Selling is a student of Louis Janssens taught for many years at the Catholic University of Louvain, Belgium.

Compromise, Cooperation, Double Effect, Minus Malum, Principle of Tolerance, etc.

Arnal, José Antonio. "¿Tolerancia o permisividad fiscal? Actitudes sociales de los españoles frente al fraude." *Moralia* 18, nos. 2-3 (abril-septiembre 1995): 203-18.

One of several articles in this issue dealing with the theme of tolerance.

Attard, Mark, O. Carm. *Compromise in Morality*. Rome, 1976.

Cafardi, Nicholas P., ed. *Voting and Holiness: Catholic Perspectives on Political Participation* New York/Mahwah: Paulist Press, 2012.

15 essays, mostly from the political Left, which focus on foundational issues like conscience formation, prudential judgment and a correct reading of the moral tradition of core concepts such as intrinsic evil and compromise with evil. One hearkens back to the 1986 Bishops Pastoral on the Economy, suggesting this might provide a more helpful model of political consultation and engagement, while several others highlight problems with the apparent conflation of enunciating moral principles with the call for adopting only one political policy or voting legitimacy. Finally, a couple helpful essays, such as Bryan Massingale's on the problematic equation of opposition to slavery with abortion, give good interpretive illustrations of the kind of practical moral discernment that is needed in approaching the moral task of political participation in a way that is truly promotive of Christian holiness. The collection is balanced and covers most aspects from the abstract to the concrete, though with a fair amount of repetition of basic premises and recaps of American religious and political history (due to lack of coordination presumably about the nature of the individual essays).

Reviewed by James T. Bretzke, S.J. in *Theological Studies* 73 (December 2012): 981-982.

Curran, Charles E. "Cooperation: Toward a Revision of the Concept and Its Application." Linacre Quarterly 41 (1974): 152-167.

Curran's position is critically discussed in Ronald Fabbro's PUG doctoral dissertation done under Klaus Demmer, Cooperation in Evil: A Consideration of the Traditional Doctrine from the Point of View of the Contemporary Discussion About the Moral Act. Excerpta ex dissertatione ad Doctoratum in Facultate Theologiae Pontificae Universitatis Gregorianaе. Roma, 1989.

Gives an historical overview of the concept and its development in the manual tradition, and then moves to address what Curran considers to be some missing elements in terms of the subjectivity and rights of conscience of the agent according to the traditional theory. Curran sets out his revision in terms of an understanding of the doctrine of religious freedom elaborated in *Dignitatis humanae*.

The periodical also incorrectly lists Curran as being a Jesuit.

Fabbro, Ronald. Cooperation in Evil: A Consideration of the Traditional Doctrine from the Point of View of the Contemporary Discussion About the Moral Act. Excerpta ex dissertatione ad Doctoratum in Facultate Theologiae Pontificae Universitatis Gregorianaе. Roma, 1989.

Dissertation done under Klaus Demmer.

Fisher, Anthony, O.P. "Co-operation with Evil." Catholic Medical Quarterly 45 (February 1994): 15-22.

Rather conservative and manualistic presentation of various forms of cooperation with evil, using examples of cases involving workers in the health-care professions. Does include a good listing of some of the traditional examples given in the moral manuals for various types of "cooperation" with evil.

Originally presented as a talk at the Catholic Medical Guild's Seminar in Medical Ethics held in London.

Fisher, an Australian bioethicist studying at Oxford, is a disciple of Finnis and Grisez.

Fuller, Jon D., S.J., and Keenan, James F. "Tolerant Signals: The Vatican's New Insights on Condoms for H.I.V. Prevention." *America* 183 (23 September 2000): 6-7.

Argues that the Vatican now accepts the "lesser of two evils" principle as applying in some cases to recommendation of condom usage for purposes of AIDS prevention.

González, Ignacio. "La tolerancia, razones y sinrazones." Moralia 18, nos. 2-3 (abril-septiembre 1995): 143-72.

One of several articles in this issue dealing with the theme of tolerance.

Grecco, Richard. A Theology of Compromise: A Study of Method in the Ethics of Charles E. Curran. American University Studies: Series, 7, Theology and Religion, 104. New York: Peter Lang, 1991.

Grecco's 1982 doctoral dissertation from St. Michael's University (Toronto) in which he assesses Curran's four-step method in moral theology by applying it to Curran's "theology of compromise."

Reviewed by Richard Gula, S.S. in Theological Studies 53 (1992): 788-789.

Harding, Carol, ed. Moral Dilemmas. Chicago: Precedent Publishing Co., 1985.

Healy, Gerald W., S.J. "Choosing the Lesser Evil: Use and Abuse." Landas 3 (1989): 199-225.

Excellent overview of the principle, as well as contemporary applications (though many of these are in the Philippine context).

Heyd, David, ed. Toleration: An Elusive Virtue. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1996.

This collection contains original contributions to the ongoing debate on the nature of toleration, including its definition, historical development, justification, and limits.

Higginson, R. Dilemmas: A Christian Approach to Moral Decision Making. Louisville: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1989.

Kaczor, Christopher. "The Tragic Case of Jodie and Mary: Questions about Separating Conjoined Twins." Linacre Quarterly 70 (May 2003): 159-170.

Against Cardinal Cormac Murphy-O'Connor and William May, Kaczor argues that the separation of Jodie and Mary was morally licit, though not morally obligatory.

Keenan, James F., S.J. "The Function of the Principle of Double Effect." Theological Studies 54 (1993): 293-315.

Questions the legitimacy of the present understanding of the application of the principle of the double effect in complicated cases, and argues instead that the principle should be

interpreted primarily as being heuristic and confirming of prudential decisions, rather than as providing a justification for difficult moral decisions.

Kopfensteiner, Thomas. "The Meaning and Role of Duress in the Cooperation of Wrongdoing." *Linacre Quarterly* 70 (May 2003): 150-158.

Considers the impact of "duress" in reference to provisions for sterilizations in Catholic health care partnerships.

Magill, Gerard. "A Moral Compass for Cooperation with Wrongdoing." Chapter 9 in *Voting and Holiness*, 135-157. Edited by Nicholas P. Cafardi. New York: Paulist Press, 2012.

Excellent summary of the manualist tradition of the norms and distinctions involved in the principles of tolerance and cooperation with evil, which he then applies to the issue of Catholic politicians and voters in regards to abortion-related legislation. In this application he gives extensive reference to Magisterial documents such as Pope John Paul II's Encyclical *Evangelium vitae*, correspondence with the then prefect of the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, Joseph Cardinal Ratzinger (later Pope Benedict XVI), and the U.S. Bishops 2007 document on political participation *Faithful Citizenship*.

Magill is professor of health-care ethics at the Center for Healthcare Ethics at Duquesne University in Pittsburgh.

_____. "Threat of Imminent Death in Pregnancy: A Role for Double-Effect Reasoning." *Theological Studies* 72:4 (December 2011): 848-878.

In the wake of the infamous Phoenix "Abortion/Excommunication" case in which Bishop Thomas Olmsted declared Sr. Margaret MacBride, a hospital administrator, excommunicated and stripped St. Joseph's Hospital of its "Catholic" designation this article revisits the moral dilemma of the pregnant woman who faced certain death and in which regardless of what was done or not done the fetus would not survive. Magill argues (counter to the Bishop) that the termination of the pregnancy was justified according to the principle of the double-effect.

Morlino, Robert C. "The Principles of the Lesser of Evils in Today's Conflict Situations: New Challenges to Moral Theology from a Pluralistic Society." S.T.D. Dissertation: Pontifical Gregorian University, Rome, 1990.

Directed by Ivan Fucek, S.J. Discusses 20th century manualists (such as Hürth, Vermeersch, and Zalba), as well as papal and episcopal writings in areas of the principle of the lesser of evils, and makes some tentative illustrations in reference to contemporary moral issues such as condom education in the AIDS crisis and the acceptability of a national policy of nuclear deterrence.

Morlino, a former Jesuit, is now bishop of Madison, Wisconsin.

Moya, José, and Ana I. Cilleruelo. "Raíces psicosociales de la intolerancia." *Moralia* 18, nos. 2-3 (abril-septiembre 1995): 173-88.

One of several articles in this issue dealing with the theme of tolerance.

van Ouwekerk, Conrad. "Gospel Morality and Human Compromise." *Concilium* 5 (1965): 5-12.

Quinn, Msgr. Francis. "The Church and AIDS Prevention." *Origins* 21 (5 March 1992): 635-636.

Argues against condom distribution in high schools, but does counsel condom use if one has the HIV virus and has already decided to engage in "sinful sexual activity."

Quinn was at the time bishop of Sacramento, California.

Rigali, Norbert J., S.J. "Evil and Models of Christian Ethics." *Horizons* 8 (1981): 7-22.

Rigali was professor of moral theology at the University of San Diego.

Renick, Timothy M. "Charity Lost: The Secularization of the Principle of Double Effect in the Just-War Tradition." *The Thomist* 58 (1994): 441-462.

Rhonheimer, Martin, O.D. *Vital Conflicts in Medical Ethics: A Virtue Approach to Craniotomy and Tubal Pregnancies*. Edited by William F. Murphy, Jr. Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University Press of America, 2009.

A study originally commissioned by the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith in 2000 and which was ordered published (first in German) "so that the theses it contains could be discussed by specialists." While Rhonheimer does not follow what he considers to be a "weighing of goods" approach to moral analysis (which he identifies as the theory of proportionalism condemned in *Veritatis splendor*) he does take issue with traditionalistic arguments that in his view are now "obsolete," "outdated," and ultimately misconstrue the correct meaning of discerning the distinction between "direct" and "indirect" in terms of abortion.

Rhonheimer is professor of moral theology at Santa Croce, the Opus Dei school in Rome.

Rubio, Julie Hanlon. "Moral Cooperation with Evil and Social Ethics." *Journal of the Society of Christian Ethics* 31:1 (Spring/Summer 2011): 103-122.

Reviews the manualist understandings of cooperation with evil and the more recent use of this term in debates over election support for certain politicians or parties, and then

applies this concept to social sin and moral responsibility, using sweatshop clothing manufacture as an illustrative example.

Rubio is associate professor of Christian ethics at St. Louis University.

Sulmasy, Daniel P., O.F.M. "Catholic Participation in Needle-and-Syringe-Exchange Programs for Injection-Drug Users: An Ethical-Analysis." *Theological Studies* 73 (June 2012): 422-441.

Looks at critiques of needle-exchange programs in light of classical formulations of cooperation with evil and judges the critiques to be wanting in the light of that tradition.

Traina, Cristina L.H. "Oh, Susanna: The New Absolutism and Natural Law." *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 65 (1997): 371-401.

Taking up the ethical dilemma which faced Susanna in the Old Testament (Dn 13) which had been used by Pope John Paul II in his encyclical *Veritatis Splendor* to illustrate the notion of moral absolutes Traina critiques this a strong "absolutist" strain of natural law interpretation in the thought of Pope John Paul II, as well as moral philosophers such as Germain Grisez and John Finnis. Traina offers alternative solutions to the problem of relativism and consequentialism which so troubles moral absolutists by considering insights from the tradition of cooperation with evil and the epistemological nature of moral norms.

Trevisi, Enrico. "Coscienza morale e obbedienza civile. Linee dell'attuale dibattito teologico." *Dissertatio ad Lauream apud Pontificia Universitas Gregoriana*. Roma, 1991.

Doctoral dissertation done under Klaus Demmer, M.S.C.

Vacek, Edward Collins, S.J. "An Acceptable Arrangement: When Cooperation Is Not Complicity." *Commonweal* (August 11, 2016). Online version at https://www.commonwealmagazine.org/acceptable-arrangement?utm_source=Main+Reader+List&utm_campaign=10c7bd62c9-July+18+The+Week+at+Commonweal&utm_medium=email&utm_term=0_407bf353a2-10c7bd62c9-91221625 (accessed August 12, 2016).

“

The article examines the problematic arguments advanced by some moralists on why the Little Sisters of the Poor would be committing serious sin if they cooperated in giving official notice to the U.S. government that they oppose birth control coverage. The article is an excellent and quite readable treatment of the crucial distinctions between “formal (sinful) cooperation with evil and “material” cooperation (which may, or may not necessarily be sinful depending on intention and circumstances).

Vacek did his doctorate in moral philosophy and then taught moral theology for several decades, first at the now defunct Jesuit School of Theology-at-Chicago, then from 1981

onwards at the Weston School of Theology (later the Weston Jesuit School of Theology) in Cambridge, and then when that school joined the newly formed School of Theology & Ministry at Boston College (in 2008). He left that faculty in 2011 to take the Stephen Duffy Chair in Catholic Theology at Loyola University in New Orleans.

Velasco, Fernando. "La religión a prueba: tolerancia versus fanatismo." Moralia 18, nos. 2-3 (abril-septiembre 1995): 189-202.

One of several articles in this issue dealing with the theme of tolerance.

Weber, Helmut. "Il Compromesso Etico." Parte Secunda, Capitolo 6 in Problemi e prospettive di teologia morale, 199-219. A cura di Tullio Goffi. Brescia: Queriniana, 1976.

Wilting, Hans-Josef. *Der Kompromiss als theologisches und als ethisches Problem*. Düsseldorf: Patmos 1975.

You, Alain. La loi de gradualité: une nouveauté en morale? Fondements théologiques et applications. Paris: Editions P. Lethielleux, 1991.

Analyzes the principle of gradualism in terms of the magisterial teaching as well as some of the debate around *Humanae vitae* and *Familiaris consortio*.

Reviewed by Sabatino Majorano, C.Ss.R. in Studia Moralia 29 (1991): 488-492.

Proportionalism

Aquinas, Thomas. ST II-II, q. 64, n. 7

On killing the unjust aggressor Thomas maintains that one can never *intend* to kill the aggressor, rather the killing must always be indirect.

Barry, R. "A Clarification of the Double Effect." Irish Theological Quarterly 48 (1981).

Billy, D.J., C.Ss.R. "Ontic Evil and Equivocation: Revising the Terms of the Discussion." Studia Moralia 30 (1992): 321-329.

Proposes a threefold categorization of *malum* of evil as a way of avoiding the problem of equivocation in the proportionalist use of the term "ontic evil." Billy grounds his terminology in an analogous understanding of evil plus a recognition of the tension between certain Thomistic and Personalist categories.

Bouscaren, T. Lincoln, S.J. *Ethics of Ectopic Operations*. 2nd ed. Milwaukee: Bruce, 1933, 1944.

Brody, Baruch. "The Problem of Exceptions in Medical Ethics." In Doing Evil to Achieve Good: Moral Choice in Conflict Situations, 54-68. Edited by Richard A. McCormick, S.J. and Paul Ramsey. Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1978.

Cahill, Lisa Sowle. "Teleology, utilitarianism, and Christian ethics." Theological Studies 42 (1981): 601-629.

The article has for context a focus of the contemporary Catholic re-examination of moral norms: the principle of double effect, which some claim can be reduced to the criterion of proportion between an act's good and evil consequences. The article locates this claim within the teleological model of ethics, but distinguishes the theory from utilitarianism.

Cavanaugh, Thomas A. "Aquinas's Account of Double Effect." *The Thomist* 61 (1997): 107-121.

Thomas's account substantially differs from contemporary double-effect reasoning (DER) insofar as Thomas considers the ethical status of risking an assailant's life while contemporary accounts of DER focus on actions causing harm foreseen as inevitable.

_____. "Aquinas and the Historical Roots of Proportionalism." *Aquinas Review* 2 (1/1995): 31-44.

Connery, John R., S.J. "Morality of Consequences: A Critical Appraisal." *Theological Studies* 34 (1973).

Also in *Readings in Moral Theology, No. 1: Moral Norms and Catholic Tradition*, 244-266. Edited by Charles E. Curran and Richard A. McCormick, S.J. New York: Paulist Press, 1979.

_____. "The Teleology of Proportionate Reason." Theological Studies 44 (1983): 489-596.

Critiques the use of proportionate reason.

Crosby, John F. "The Creaturehood of the Human Person and the Critique of Proportionalism." In Persona Verità e Morale: Atti del Congresso Internazionale di Teologia Morale (Roma, 7-12 aprile 1986), 195-199. Roma: Città Nuova Editrice, 1987.

The Congress was sponsored jointly the John Paul II Pontifical Institute for the Study of Matrimony and the Family of the Lateran University (Msgr. Carlo Caffarra), and the Holy Cross (Santa Croce) Center in Rome of the University of Navarra (Opus Dei).

Crosby is professor of philosophy at the University of Dallas.

Curran, Charles. "Utilitarismo e teologia morale contemporanea. Per situare il dibattito." Concilium 12 (10/1976): 150-175.

DiIanni, Albert R., S.M. "The Direct/Indirect Distinction in Morals." The Thomist 41 (1977): 150-180.

Drane, James F. "Condoms, AIDS & Catholic Ethics: *Open to the Transmission of Death?*" Commonweal 118 (22 March 1991): 188-192.

Drane, a professor of clinical medical ethics at Edinboro University of Pennsylvania, shares difficulties on the application of the term "intrinsically evil" to any and all condom use. Drane suggests a more careful investigation of the moral issues involved, a full understanding of the natural law tradition, and the use of the principles of the double effect and counseling the lesser evil would all lead to a conclusion that in certain cases condom use in marriage would be morally licit.

Foot, Philippa. "The Problem of Abortion and the Doctrine of the Double Effect." In Virtues and Vices and Other Essays in Moral Philosophy, 19-32. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1981.

Frankena, William K. "McCormick and the Traditional Distinction." In Doing Evil to Achieve Good: Moral Choice in Conflict Situations, 145-164. Edited by Richard A. McCormick, S.J. and Paul Ramsey. Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1978.

Fuchs, Josef, S.J., "Christian Morality: Biblical Orientation and Human Evaluation." Gregorianum 67 (1986): 745-763.

Also found as Chapter 1 in Christian Morality: The Word Became Flesh, 1-18. Translated by Brian McNeil. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press; Dublin: Gill and Macmillan, 1987.

In italiano: "Etica cristiana: orientamento biblico e valutazione umana." Capitolo primo in Il Verbo si fa carne; teologia morale, 7-30. Casale Monferrato: Piemme, 1989.

Towards the end of this article Fuchs addresses himself to some of the mistaken understandings of proportionalism, as well as indicating what a correct understanding involves.

Gaffney, James. "The Pope on Proportionalism." In Veritatis Splendor: American Responses, ed. Michael E. Allsopp and John J. O'Keefe, 60-71. Kansas City, M.O.: Sheed & Ward, 1995.

Gaillardetz, Richard. "John Finnis and the Proportionalism Debate: A Critique of a Critique." Louvain Studies 14 (1989): 125-142.

George, Robert P. "Liberty under the Moral Law: On B. Hoose's Critique of the Grisez-Finnis Theory of Human Good." *The Heythrop Journal* 34 (1993): 175-182.

Attacks Hoose's article, "Proportionalists, Deontologists and the Human Good," *The Heythrop Journal* 33 (1992): 175-191. Hoose has a response to George under the title "Basic Goods: Continuing the Debate." *The Heythrop Journal* 35 (1994): 58-63.

George is at Princeton University.

Haber, Joram Graf, ed. *Absolutism and its Consequentialist Critics*. Lanham MD: University Press of America, 1994.

Is the judicial execution of the innocent permissible to deter crime? Some advocates of consequentialism would respond yes, while moral absolutists argue that certain kinds of conduct, including this one, are absolutely prohibited, no matter what the consequences. The 17 essays selected for inclusion represent the major contributions to its defense and criticism, and define the contemporary discussion. In addition, Haber contributes an extensive bibliographic essay in which he defends his own version of moral absolutism.

Hallett, Garth L. *Greater Good: The Case of Proportionalism*. Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 1995.

Hallett proposes judging acts using a norm he calls Value Maximization. He defines this norm and offers a full response to such critics of all forms of proportionalism as Finnis and Grisez.

Hoose, Bernard. *Proportionalism: The American Debate and its European Roots*. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 1987.

Revised doctoral dissertation done at the Pontifical Gregorian University under Josef Fuchs, S.J., tracing the development and theological issues contained in the moral theory of proportionalism, from the initial publication of Peter Knauer, S.J.'s 1965 article on a revised approach to the Principle of the Double Effect through subsequent writings and debate primarily in Germany and North America. Also contains a good bibliography of the relevant literature.

Hoose taught until his retirement on the faculty of Heythrop College, London.

_____. "Proportionalism: A Right Relationship Among Values." *Louvain Studies* 24 (Spring 1999): 40-56.

_____. "Proportionalists, Deontologists and the Human Good." *The Heythrop Journal* 33 (1992): 175-191.

Discusses the theories of Germain Grisez in terms of the human good, and his extreme reluctance to accept even the hypothetical possibility of disagreeing with the

Magisterium. Hoose goes on to clarify part of the problematic of the incommensurability of goods associated with the proportionalist school.

See also the response by Robert P. George, "Liberty under the Moral Law: On B. Hoose's Critique of the Grisez-Finnis Theory of Human Good." The Heythrop Journal 34 (1993): 175-182. Hoose has a response to George under the title "Basic Goods: Continuing the Debate." The Heythrop Journal 35 (1994): 58-63.

Janssens, Louis. "Ontic Evil and Moral Evil." *Louvain Studies* 4 (1972): 115-156.

Also found in *Readings in Moral Theology, No. 1: Moral Norms and Catholic Tradition*, 40-93. Edited by Charles E. Curran and Richard A. McCormick, S.J. New York: Paulist Press, 1979.

Presents a careful reading of St. Thomas before moving on to developing the distinction between ontic evil and moral evil.

_____. "Teleology and Proportionality: Thoughts about the Encyclical *Veritatis Splendor*." In The Splendor of Accuracy: An Examination of the Assertions Made by *Veritatis Splendor*. 99-113. Edited by Joseph A. Selling and Jan Jans. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1994.

John Paul II. "Discourse to the International Congress of Moral Theology." Rome 10 April 1986. In Persona Verità e Morale: Atti del Congresso Internazionale di Teologia Morale (Roma, 7-12 aprile 1986), 11-14. Roma: Città Nuova Editrice, 1987.

In this discourse the Pope repeated the affirmation of immutable concrete moral norms, and gave as two examples the prohibition against contraception and direct killing of the innocent. The tone of the Pope's discourse is clearly that of the Caffarra-Grisez-Finnis line, and contains many thinly veiled negative references to the Proportionalist school.

The Congress was sponsored jointly the John Paul II Pontifical Institute for the Study of Matrimony and the Family of the Lateran University (Msgr. Carlo Caffarra), and the Holy Cross (Santa Croce) Center in Rome of the University of Navarra (Opus Dei).

Johnson, Mark. "Proportionalism and a Text of the Young Aquinas: Quodlibetum IX, Q.7, A.2." Theological Studies 53 (1992): 683-699.

Johnson teaches philosophy and religion at St. Joseph's College in Rensselaer, IN.

Johnstone, Brian V., C.Ss.R. "The Meaning of Proportionate Reason in Contemporary Moral Theology." The Thomist 49 (1985): 223-247.

Johnstone, an Australian, was professor of moral theology at the Alphonsianum in Rome and now teaches at the Catholic University of America.

Kaczor, Christopher, ed. *Proportionalism: For and Against*. Marquette Studies in Philosophy, 19. Milwaukee: Marquette University Press, 1999.

Reviewed by Edward Vacek, S.J. in *Theological Studies* 63 (September 2002): 651.

Kaczor, Christopher. "Double-Effect Reasoning from Jean Pierre Gury to Peter Knauer." *Theological Studies* 59 (1998): 297-316.

Historical overview of the tradition of double effect reasoning from Thomas Aquinas to Peter Knauer, indicating important distinctions and developments made in this field.

Keenan, James F., S.J. "The Function of the Principle of Double Effect." *Theological Studies* 54 (1993): 293-315.

Questions the legitimacy of the present understanding of the application of the principle of the double effect in complicated cases, and argues instead that the principle should be interpreted primarily as being heuristic and confirming of prudential decisions, rather than as providing a justification for difficult moral decisions.

Kelly, James. "Is Consequentialist Reasoning Really Teleological?" In Persona Verità e Morale: Atti del Congresso Internazionale di Teologia Morale (Roma, 7-12 aprile 1986), 813-822. Roma: Città Nuova Editrice, 1987.

The Congress was sponsored jointly the John Paul II Pontifical Institute for the Study of Matrimony and the Family of the Lateran University (Msgr. Carlo Caffarra), and the Holy Cross (Santa Croce) Center in Rome of the University of Navarra (Opus Dei).

Kelly is professor of ethics at the Holy Cross (Santa Croce) Center in Rome.

Kiely, Bartholomew, M., S.J. "The Impracticality of Proportionalism," *Gregorianum* 66 (1985): 655-686.

Negative view of proportionalism.

Kiely is professor of psychology at the Pontifical Gregorian University in Rome, and consultant to the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith [CDF].

Knauer, Peter, S.J. "La détermination du bien et du mal par le principe du double effet." *Nouvelle Revue Theologique* 87 (1965): 356-376.

In English: "The Hermeneutic Function of the Principle of the Double Effect." In Readings in Moral Theology, No. 1: Moral Norms and Catholic Tradition, 1-39. Edited by Charles E. Curran and Richard A. McCormick, S.J. New York: Paulist Press, 1979.

Also found in English in Natural Law Forum 12 (1967): 132-162.

Auf Deutsch: "Das rechverstandene Prinzip von der Doppeltwirkung als Grundnorm jeder Gewissensentscheidung." Theologie und Glaube 57 (1967): 107-133.

The German and English versions are a slightly reworked presentation of the French article, responding to certain criticisms the latter had evoked. In many ways this article can be taken as the beginning of the modern proportionalist debate.

Lowery, Mark. "A New Proposal for the Proportionalist/ Traditionalist Discussion." Irish Theological Quarterly 61 (1995): 115-24.

Argues that referring to the particular "specifications" of an act may be one way of resolving the impasse in the debate between the proportionalists and traditionalists concerning the concept of intrinsically evil acts.

McCormick, Richard A., S.J., and Ramsey, Paul, eds. Doing Evil to Achieve Good: Moral Choice in Conflict Situations. Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1978.

Includes essays by Baruch Brody, William K. Frankena, Bruno Schüller, S.J., as well as contributions by Ramsey and McCormick, all of which deal in some way with McCormick's reformulation of the principle of the double effect, given as the 1973 Père Marquette Lecture, delivered at Marquette University in Milwaukee, Wisconsin (and which is included in this volume as well).

McCormick, Richard A., S.J. "Ambiguity in Moral Choice." In Doing Evil to Achieve Good: Moral Choice in Conflict Situations, 7-53. Edited by Richard A. McCormick, S.J. and Paul Ramsey. Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1978.

McCormick's famous 1973 Père Marquette Lecture, delivered at Marquette University in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, on a reformulation of the principle of the double effect.

_____. "A Commentary on the Commentaries." In Doing Evil to Achieve Good: Moral Choice in Conflict Situations, 193-267. Edited by Richard A. McCormick, S.J. and Paul Ramsey. Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1978.

McCormick's evaluation of the essays included in this volume, all of which relate in some way to his own seminal work, "Ambiguity in Moral Choice."

_____. "Il principio del duplice effetto." Concilium 12 (10/1976): 129-149.

_____. "Proportionalism: Clarification Through Dialogue." In *The Historical Development of Fundamental Moral Theology in the United States: Readings in Moral Theology, 11*, 181-199. Edited by Charles E. Curran and Richard A. McCormick, S.J. New York: Paulist Press, 1999.

Appeared originally in *Theological Studies* 43 (1982) and 44 (1983).

McKeever, Paul E. "Proportionalism As a Methodology in Catholic Moral Theology." In Human Sexuality and Personhood: Proceedings of the Workshop for the Hierarchies of the United States and Canada Sponsored by the Pope John Center through a Grant from the Knights of Columbus, 211-222. Rev. ed. St. Louis: Pope John Center, 1981, 1990.

McKinney, Ronald H., S.J. "The Quest for an Adequate Proportionalist Theory of Value." The Thomist 53 (1989): 56-73.

Melchin, Kenneth R. "Revisionists, Deontologists, and the Structure of Moral Understanding." Theological Studies 51 (1990): 389-416.

Discusses the recent debate over premoral norms, the direct/indirect distinction, exceptionless norms, intrinsic evil, and moral authority in terms of procedural criteria for data selection, classification, and values-prioritization in the empirical methods of moral theology.

Author teaches moral theology at St. Paul University in Ottawa.

Montaldi, Daniel F. "A Defense of St. Thomas and the Principle of the Double Effect." Journal of Religious Ethics 14 (1986): 296-332.

Murphy, Séamus, S.J. "Notes on Proportionality." Milltown Studies 39 (1997): 78-95.

Discusses the *jus ad bellum* criteria in terms of the moral theory of proportionality. Clearly written and helpful in articulating just war theory.

Odozor, Paulinus Ikechukwu, C.S.Sp. Richard A. McCormick and the Renewal of Moral Theology. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1995.

Outka, Gene H. and Ramsey, Paul, eds. *Norm and Context in Christian Ethics*. London: SCM Press, 1968.

Quite a good collection of articles by Protestant and Roman Catholic ethicists covering a number of topics related to the notion of moral norms and conflict situations.

van Ouwerkerk, Coenraad, C.Ss.R. "Gospel Morality and Human Compromise." Concilium 5 (1/1965): 5-12.

Pinckaers, Servais, O.P. *Ce qu'on ne peut jamais faire : la question des actes intrinsèquement mauvais, histoire et discussion*. Series: Etudes d'éthique chrétienne 19. Paris: Cerf, 1986.

This book was commissioned by the then Cardinal Prefect of the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, Joseph Ratzinger, and its printing costs were also underwritten by the same Congregation.

_____. "The New Law in *Veritatis Splendor*." *Josephinum Journal of Theology* 3 (2/1996): 47-63.

Argues that the New Law, especially the Thomistic exposition of this, is at the cornerstone of Catholic moral theology outlined in *Veritatis Splendor*, and that the moral theory of proportionalism is incompatible with an ethics grounded in Scripture, and therefore ultimately inimical to Catholic moral theology.

_____. "La question des actes intrinsèquement mauvais et le proportionalisme." *Revue Thomiste* 84 (1984): 618-624.

Porter, Jean. "'Direct' and 'Indirect' in Grisez's Moral Theory." *Theological Studies* 57 (1996): 611-632.

Porter is professor of theology at the University of Notre Dame.

Quirk, Michael J. "Why the Debate on Proportionalism Is Misconceived." *Modern Theology* 13 (October 1997): 501-524.

Ramsey, Paul. "Incommensurability and Indeterminacy in Moral Choice." In Doing Evil to Achieve Good: Moral Choice in Conflict Situations, 69-144. Edited by Richard A. McCormick, S.J. and Paul Ramsey. Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1978.

Here Ramsey develops his own position of indeterminacy and incommensurability in moral conflict situations. Primarily he dialogues with the positions of Richard McCormick and Bruno Schüller, though others are mentioned as well.

Rhonheimer, Martin. "Intentional Actions and the Meaning of Object: A Reply to Richard McCormick." The Thomist 59 (April 1995): 279-311.

Critiques McCormick's own critique of an earlier article by Rhonheimer, as well as proportionalist theory in regards to the disputed point over moral intentionality and intrinsically evil acts.

Schüller, Bruno, S.J. "The Double Effect in Catholic Thought: A Reevaluation." In Doing Evil to Achieve Good: Moral Choice in Conflict Situations, 165-192. Edited by Richard A. McCormick, S.J. and Paul Ramsey. Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1978.

Selling, Joseph A. "The Problem of Reinterpreting the Principle of Double Effect." *Louvain Studies* 8 (1980): 47-62.

Selling is a student of Louis Janssens and taught for many years at the Catholic University of Louvain, Belgium.

_____. "Proportionate Reasoning and the Concept of Ontic Evil: The Moral Legacy of Louis Janssens." *Louvain Studies* 27 (2002): 3-28.

Smith, Janet E. "Veritatis Splendor, Proportionalism, and Contraception." *Irish Theological Quarterly* 63 (1998): 307-326.

Theron, Stephen. "Consequentialism and Natural Law." In Persona Verità e Morale: Atti del Congresso Internazionale di Teologia Morale (Roma, 7-12 aprile 1986), 177-193. Roma: Città Nuova Editrice, 1987.

Critique of proportionalist theory, especially the distinction of moral and non-moral good/evil.

The Congress was sponsored jointly the John Paul II Pontifical Institute for the Study of Matrimony and the Family of the Lateran University (Msgr. Carlo Caffarra), and the Holy Cross (Santa Croce) Center in Rome of the University of Navarra (Opus Dei).

Tuohey, John F. "The Principle of Totality: A Reassessment of the Content of *II-IIq.65, a.1.* and Its Role in Ethics." Irish Theological Quarterly 61 (1995): 294-311.

Ugorji, L.I. The Principle of Double Effect: A Critical Appraisal of its Traditional Understanding and its Modern Reinterpretation. Eur. Univ. Stud., 23. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 1985.

Uniacke, Suzanne M. "The Doctrine of the Double Effect." The Thomist 48 (1984): 188-218.

Vacek, Edward, S.J. "Proportionalism: One View of the Debate." Theological Studies 46 (1985): 287-314.

Vacek is Professor of Moral Theology at the Weston Jesuit School of Theology.

Van Der Poel, Cornelius J. "The Principle of Double Effect." In Absolutes in Moral Theology?, 186-210. Edited by Charles E. Curran. Washington, D.C.: Corpus Books, 1968.

En español: ¿Principios Absolutos en Teología Moral? «Teología y Mundo Actual», 24. Traducción de José Maria Ruiz, S.J. Santander: Editorial Sal Terrae, 1970.
