

HUMANAE VITAE SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

Compiled by

James T. Bretzke, S.J., S.T.D.
Marquette University
E-mail: jbretzke@jesuits.org

URL: <https://www2.bc.edu/james-bretzke/HumanaeVitaeBibliography.pdf>

Last Update: October 1, 2018

N.B. This is merely a *Select Bibliography*, intending to give the basic magisterial documents involved with the 1968 Encyclical by Paul VI and a “sampling” of the range of other works that have a direct bearing on the Encyclical. For the larger moral issues involved with birth control, moral norms, and the magisterium see my other online research bibliographies and especially my *A Research Bibliography in Christian Ethics and Catholic Moral Theology*. Lewiston NY: Edwin Mellen Press, 2006. Also see my online *Bibliography on Sexual Ethics* at <https://www2.bc.edu/james-bretzke/SexualEthicsBibliography.pdf>.

Table of Contents

CHURCH DOCUMENTS	1
<i>Papal Magisterial Documents</i>	1
<i>Curial Documents</i>	2
<i>Other Church, Magisterial Documents or Related Titles</i>	2
OTHER WORKS ON HUMANAE VITAE	3

CHURCH DOCUMENTS

Papal Magisterial Documents

N.B. *Many of these official Church documents are widely available on a number of Catholic related Web-sites on the Internet*

Paul VI, Pope. *Humanae vitae* (Encyclical Letter on the Regulation of Births). 25 July 1968. AAS 60 (1968): 481-503.

Among numerous other sources, the Encyclical can be found in Austin Flannery, O.P., ed. *Vatican Council II. More Post-Conciliar Documents*, 397-416. Collegeville: The Liturgical Press, 1982. It is also on the web-site of the Holy See (Vatican) at this URL:

http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/paul_vi/encyclicals/documents/hf_p-vi_enc_25071968_humanae-vitae_en.html. This was to be Pope Paul VI's last Encyclical even though he reigned another ten years.

Organized into three major sections: *New Aspects of the Problem and Competency of the Magisterium*, *Doctrinal Principles*, and *Pastoral Directives*. Reaffirmed the Catholic Church's ban on artificial contraception. This Encyclical continues to be the source of considerable debate and acrimony in the field of moral theology. The Pope issued his Encyclical three years after the Pontifical Commission on Population, Family and Birth, a special papal commission entrusted with the study of this issue, voted overwhelmingly to change the Church's teaching in this area. Pope Paul VI reigned from 1963 until August, 1978.

Curial Documents

Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith. Note On the Moral Norm of "*Humanae Vitae*" and Pastoral Duty." Published in the English edition of *Osservatore Romano* (27 February 1989): 7. Also found online at

http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/congregations/cfaith/documents/rc_con_cfaith_doc_19890216_norma-morale_en.html

Other Church, Magisterial Documents or Related Titles

Canadian Bishops' Statement on the Encyclical *Humanae Vitae*. (Winnipeg Statement) 27 September 1968. Available online at <http://www.catholic-legate.com/articles/winnipeg.html>.

Paragraph #26 states: Counsellors may meet others who, accepting the teaching of the Holy Father, find that because of particular circumstances they are involved in what seems to them a clear conflict of duties, e.g., the reconciling of conjugal love and responsible parenthood with the education of children already born or with the health of the mother. In accord with the accepted principles of moral theology, if these persons have tried sincerely but without success to pursue a line of conduct in keeping with the given directives, they may be safely assure that, whoever honestly chooses that course which seems right to him does so in good conscience.

Committee for Pro-Life Activities of the National Conference of Catholic Bishops (USA). "Human Sexuality in God's Plan." *Catholic International* 4 (October 1993): 485-487.

Statement marking the 25th anniversary of *Humanae Vitae*, and originally published in

the English edition of *L'Osservatore Romano* on 28 July 1993.

Dupuy, Archbishop. "Pastoral Approaches." Found in Robert Blair Kaiser, *The Encyclical That Never Was: The Story of the Pontifical Commission on Population, Family and Birth, 1964-1966*, 19-25. London: Sheed & Ward, 1985, 1987.

Originally appeared in *The Tablet* on 21 September 1968.

Pontifical Commission on Population, Family and Birth. "Final Report." Found in Robert Blair Kaiser, *The Encyclical That Never Was: The Story of the Pontifical Commission on Population, Family and Birth, 1964-1966*, 1-18. London: Sheed & Ward, 1985, 1987.

Untener, Msgr. Kenneth. "*Humanae vitae*: What Has It Done to Us?" *Commonweal* (18 June 1993).

Critiques the polarizing effect of *Humanae vitae*, noting that "In the eyes of many people, the teaching Church has committed a teacher's cardinal sin: it has become more concerned about itself than about the truth." (p. 12)

Untener was until his death Bishop of Saginaw, Michigan.

Winnipeg Statement. See Canadian Bishops' Statement on the Encyclical "*Humanae Vitae*."

OTHER WORKS ON *HUMANAE VITAE*

AA.VV. «*Humanae vitae*»: 20 anni dopo. *Atti del II Congresso Internazionale di Teologia Morale, Roma, 9-12 novembre 1988*. Milano: Edizioni Ares, 1989.

Congress supporting *Humanae vitae* sponsored by the John Paul II Pontifical Institute for the Study of Marriage and the Family (Lateran University) and two institutions of Opus Dei: Centro Accademico Romano della Santa Croce and the Università di Navarra.

AA.VV. *Natural Family Planning: Nature's Way--God's Way*. Milwaukee: De Rance, Inc., 1980.

Three main parts deal with 1) Experience of NFP, 2) Sciences, and 3) Theology. An appendix provides excerpts various magisterial documents dealing with contraception. Theological contributions from Carlo Caffarra, Edouard Hamel, S.J., Boniface Honings, Gustave Martelet, S.J., Dionigi Tettamanzi, and Marcellino Zalba, S.J.

Bak, Felix. "Bernard Häring and *Humanae Vitae*." *Antonianum* 49 (1974): 198-238.

von Balthasar, Hans Urs. "A Word on *Humanae Vitae*." *Communio* 20 (1993): 437-450.

Reprinted from von Balthasar's *New Elucidations*, (San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1986).

Auf Deutsch: Neue Klarstellungen. Einsiedeln: Johannes Verlag, 1979.

Barberi, Michael J. and Selling, Joseph A. "The Origin of *Humanae vitae* and the Impasse in Fundamental Theological Ethics." *Louvain Studies* 4/37 (2013): 364-389.

Argues that many of the ideas in *Humanae vitae* can be traced to the moral philosophy and involvement of Karol Wojtyla (later Pope John Paul II), and that this then would further weaken the force of the Encyclical if it were in fact found to be so reliant upon the influence of this one individual and his own small circle of advisers and collaborators (such as the Polish psychiatrist Dr. Wanda Poltawska who held that women often suffered from neuroses caused by contraception usage).

Bier, William C., S.J., ed. *Conscience: Its Freedom and Limitations.* New York: Fordham University Press, 1971.

Contains a number of articles treating of conscience from diverse perspectives, theological, psychological, philosophical, civil disobedience, *Humanae vitae*, etc.

Callahan, Daniel, ed. *The Catholic Case for Contraception.* London: Macmillan, 1969.

Articles and essays by theologians and doctors opposed to *Humanae vitae*.

Cole, Basil, O.P. "*Humanae Vitae* and Some Principles for Re-Evangelization." *Faith and Reason* 19 (1993): 95ff.

Commonweal. "An Unhealed Wound: *Commonweal* and *Humanae Vitae*." *Commonweal* (June 15, 2018): 9-24.

After a short introduction by editor Paul Baumann, the article presents a collection of a range of short takes on the Church's teaching on contraception, starting with G.K. Chesterton in 1924 through various others, concluding with three selections published in 2015.

Connor, Robert A. "Natural Law versus the 'Contralife Will'." *Divus Thomas* 93 (1990): 32-57.

Examines the position of Ford, Grisez, Boyle, Finnis, and May on *Humanae vitae* (i.e., that contraception is evil because it is "contra-life"), and argues that the moral theory of the encyclical would be better served by considering its grounding in the objectivity of the Thomistic *esse* of the person.

Cozzoli, Mauro. “Dall’*Humanae vitae* all’*Amoris laetitia*. Parte Prima. Il bene del matrimonio e della famiglia.” *Studia Moralia* 55/2 (2017): 225-242.

Curran, Charles E., Hunt, Robert E., et al.. *Dissent in and for the Church*. New York: Sheed and Ward, 1969.

Articles dealing with the fallout of theologians who opposed Pope Paul VI’s 1968 Encyclical *Humanae Vitae* which condemned artificial contraception.

Curran, Charles E., Hunt, John F., et al.. *The Responsibility of Dissent: The Church and Academic Freedom*. New York: Sheed and Ward, 1969.

Curran, Charles E. and McCormick, Richard A., S.J., eds. *Readings in Moral Theology, No. 3: The Magisterium and Morality*. New York: Paulist Press, 1982.

Curran, Charles E. “*Humanae Vitae* and the *sensus fidelium*: On moral issues, the church must learn from the experiences of baptized people.” *National Catholic Reporter* June 25, 2018 at <https://www.ncronline.org/news/people/humanae-vitae-and-sensus-fidelium>

Part of an ongoing series on “*Humanae vitae* at 50” published by the *National Catholic Reporter* at <https://www.ncronline.org/feature-series/humanae-vitae-at-50/stories> (accessed June 26, 2018)

Curran begins by reviewing the issues that arose shortly after the publication of the Encyclical in 1968 and its problematic reception both by professional theologians and the lay faithful. This non-reception leads Curran to posit that the *sensus fidelium* may also be a valid concept in moral matters, and not just in doctrinal concerns. “In the last decade or so, theologians have emphasized the role of the *sensus fidelium* with regard to morality and not just beliefs. Morality by its very nature is quite different from beliefs, since morality deals with concrete actions that, in this instance, take place in the world. There is no doubt that beliefs can develop and even change over time. But morality is much more open to change because it occurs in changing historical circumstances. Thus in questions of morality, the experience of the baptized in their daily lives forms an important part of the *sensus fidelium*.” Curran’s basic point on “non-reception” of the key teaching in HV is fairly easy to find. See, for example, the study published by Roanoke College Professor of History, Mary J. Henold, “How Catholic women fought against Vatican’s prohibition on contraceptives,” *The Conversation* (June 25, 2018) <https://theconversation.com/how-catholic-women-fought-against-vaticans-prohibition-on-contraceptives-94544>

_____. “Strand Four: Papal Teaching Office.” Ch. 4 in Id. *The Development of Moral Theology: Five Strands*, 148-223. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press, 2013.

Much of this chapter deals with the arguments and claims revolving around papal Catholic Social Teaching from Leo XIII onwards, and special focus on Paul VI’s 1968

Humanae vitae and John Paul II's 1993 *Veritatis Splendor*.

Dillon, Michelle. "What do we know about how Catholics inform their consciences?" *National Catholic Reporter* (June 18, 2018) <https://www.ncronline.org/news/people/what-do-we-know-about-how-catholics-inform-their-consciences>

"Newly available data from the Sixth National Survey of American Catholics (gathered in April 2017) illuminates Catholics' moral decision-making process. The question asked: "When you have an important moral decision to make, which, if any, of the following activities or sources do you use usually look to for guidance?"

Irrespective of what specific moral decisions respondents may have had in mind when answering the question, the overall pattern of responses underscores the significance of private prayer and friends and family rather than official church sources. ... While additional numbers of Catholics use all of these sources sometimes, it is nonetheless striking that three in four rarely or never talk to their local priest on such matters or read the catechism. And over 80 percent rarely or never turn to papal encyclicals for guidance, or to diocesan or U.S. bishops' websites."

Part of an ongoing series on "*Humanae vitae* at 50" published by the *National Catholic Reporter* at <https://www.ncronline.org/feature-series/humanae-vitae-at-50/stories> (accessed June 26, 2018)

Dulles, Avery, S.J. "'*Humanae Vitae*': How the Dissent Affects the Church." *Origins* 22 (1993): 774-777.

Dulles, an ecclesialogist, lists what he calls "seven deleterious consequences" of the wide-spread dissent from the teaching of *Humanae vitae*. His listing is quite straightforward, and calls both sides to greater reflection.

Address given in a workshop on medical and moral issues sponsored by the Pope John XXIII Medical-Moral Research and Education Center, and held in Dallas from 1-5 February 1993.

Dummett, Michael. "Indefensible: Moral Teaching After 'Humane Vitae'." *Commonweal* (11 February 2011): 15-17.

Writing as a philosopher Dummett concludes that the argumentation and principles utilized by *Humanae vitae* to condemn artificial contraception as always immoral are illogical and therefore indefensible.

Dummett was professor of logic at Oxford until his retirement in 1992.

Faggioli, Massimo. "*Humanae Vitae*, a Half-Century On: How Different Catholics Read It." *Commonweal* (January 9, 2018).

<https://www.commonwealmagazine.org/humanae-vitae-half-century>

Faggioli, a church historian with expertise in the reception of Vatican II, notes that “the U.S. bishops are far more excited about celebrating the anniversary of *Humanae Vitae* than their counterparts in the rest of the world, who seem to be looking at marriage and family with a different kind of focus. And this ‘enthusiasm gap’ is reflective of more than just the present moment; it suggests continuation of the skirmishes within the Church that have persisted through Francis’s papacy.” Faggioli goes on to outline several problems, including an a-historical anti-intellectualism about the drafting of the Encyclical, as well as a “tendency to reduce understanding of a particularly sensitive papal teaching and its reception to a particular cultural and geographic point of view, and then universalize it,” and finally, and perhaps most “grievously” on the part of the ultra-conservative HV culture warriors a lament that “[w]hat is unforgivable, for some, is that Pope Francis is not part of the neo-conservative and neo-traditionalist American consensus.”

Foran, John E., M.D. “Ectopic Pregnancy: Current Treatment Options, *deju vu Humanae Vitae.*” *Linacre Quarterly* 66 (February 1999): 21-28.

Very critical of removal of the fetus in ectopic pregnancies—calling it a “direct abortion” and asking for a strong condemnation of this practice by the CDF.

Ford, John C., S.J., and Kelly, Gerald, S.J. *Contemporary Moral Theology.* Westminster MD: The Newman Press, 1958.

Ford and Kelly were two of the principal pre-Vatican II moral theologians, and Ford was an important contributor to the drafting of Paul VI’s encyclical *Humanae vitae* on birth control.

Foy, Msgr. Vincent N. *Birth Control: Is Canada out of step with Rome?* Toronto: Life Ethics Information Centre, 2005. Also available in PDF online at <http://www.godsplanforlife.org/Winnipeg/birthcontrol.pdf>.

Defends the teaching of *Humanae vitae* and suggests that contraception should be considered to be as grievous as abortion. Also discusses and critiques the Canadian bishops statement on *Humanae vitae*, the so-called “Winnipeg Statement,” as not being as clear and strict about the teaching against contraception as it should be, and argues that it should be formerly recalled. The book contains both the texts of the Winnipeg Statement and *Humanae vitae*.

Grabowski, John S. “*Evangelium Vitae* and *Humanae Vitae*: A tale of two encyclicals.” *Homiletic and Pastoral Review* 97 (November 1996): 7-15.

Very sympathetic exposition of John Paul II’s sexual ethics.

Grabowski teaches at the Catholic University of America.

Grisez, Germain G., Joseph Boyle, John Finnis, and William E. May. "NFP: Not Contralife." In their *The Teaching of Humanae vitae: A Defense*, 81-92. San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1988.

This chapter is also found in *Readings in Moral Theology No. 8: Dialogue About Catholic Sexual Teaching*, 126-134. Edited by Charles E. Curran and Richard A. McCormick, S.J. New York: Paulist Press, 1993.

Grisez, Germain G. "Magisterium's Responsibility and Public Dissent." In *Teaching the Catholic Faith: Central Questions for the '90's*, 155-160. Proceedings of the Thirteenth Convention of the Fellowship of Catholic Scholars, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, 1990. Edited by Msgr. Eugene V. Clark. New York: St. John's University Edition, with the Fellowship of Catholic Scholars, 1991.

Originally appeared in «*Humanae vitae*»: 20 anni dopo. *Atti del II Congresso Internazionale di Teologia Morale, Roma, 9-12 novembre 1988*. Milano: Edizioni Ares, 1989.

The Fellowship of Catholic Scholars was founded in 1977 and includes, among others, Joseph Fessio, S.J., Germain Grisez, James Hitchcock, Donald Keefe, S.J., Msgr. George A. Kelly, Ronald Lawler, OFM, Cap., William E. May, Msgr. William B. Smith, et al..

_____. "A New Formulation of a Natural-Law Argument against Contraception." *The Thomist* 30 (1966): 343-361.

Hagen, John D., Jr., and Tentler, Leslie Woodcock. "*Humanae vitae*'s Legacy: Two Views." *Commonweal* (4 June 2004): 8-10.

Hagen is a lawyer in Minneapolis and Tentler is professor of history at The Catholic University of America.

Hanigan, James P. *What Are They Saying About Sexual Morality?*. New York: Paulist Press, 1982.

This book is a good survey of the general themes and conflict areas in Roman Catholic sexual ethics today. Special attention is given to the work of Philip Keane, André Guindon, the CTSA Study on Human Sexuality (Kosnik, et. al.), as well as *Humanae Vitae* and the 1975 CDF Declaration on Sexual Ethics.

Hanigan, a former Jesuit, is married and taught moral theology at Duquesne University.

Harrison, Brian W., O.S. "The Ex Cathedra Status of the Encyclical *Humanae Vitae*." *Faith and Reason* 19 (1993): 25-78.

Maintains that the Encyclical is formally infallible.

Henold, Mary J. "How Catholic women fought against Vatican's prohibition on contraceptives." *The Conversation* (June 25, 2018) <https://theconversation.com/how-catholic-women-fought-against-vaticans-prohibition-on-contraceptives-94544>

Historical overview from roughly the 1940's to the present, indicating that despite the re-affirmation of the ban against contraception in the 1968 Encyclical, most Catholic women in the United States seem to have come to their own conclusions on the morality of the practice of artificial birth control independent of the magisterial teaching, as their use is virtually identical with the whole population.

Henold is the John R. Turbyfill Professor of History, Roanoke College.

Hilpert, Konrad and Sigrid Müller, eds. *Humanae vitae - die anstößige Enzyklika: Eine kritische Würdigung*. Munich: Herder, 2018. ISBN: 978-3-451-38256-7

From the publisher's announcement (translated from the German) 50 years after its promulgation the reception of *Humanae vitae* still ranges from vehement rejection to passionate vindication. No other papal text has provoked more controversy than this encyclical by Paul VI, which is - even today - often reduced to the strict prohibition of artificial contraception. For this reason, renowned theologians and social ethicists have decided to critically appraise content and reception of *Humanae vitae*. The book contains contributions from Antonio Autiero, Christof Breitsameter, Kirsten Danelzik, Stephan Ernst, Stephan Goertz, Konrad Hilpert, Katharina Klöcker, Elmar Kos, Andreas Lob-Hüdepohl, Gerhard Marschütz, Karl-Wilhelm Merks, Sigrid Müller, Ulrich Ruh, Jochen Sautermeister, Walter Schaupp, Kerstin Schlögl-Flierl, Joachim Schmiedl, Eberhard Schockenhoff, Joachim Wiemeyer and Werner Wolbert.

Hogan, Margaret Monahan. *Finality and Marriage*. Milwaukee, WI: Marquette University Press, 1993. Revised edition: *Marriage As A Relationship: Real and Rational*. Afterword by Sidney Callahan. Marquette Studies in Philosophy 34. Milwaukee: Marquette University Press, 2002.

Chapter One deals with the past recovery of the tradition in Pius XI and Pius XII. Chapter Two deals with the present recovery of the tradition by looking at *Gaudium et spes*, *Humanae vitae*, and *Donum vitae*. Chapter Three outlines an emerging position on marriage as a human relationship, and Chapter Four is an epilogue which gives responses to questions raised in the earlier edition. These treat the departure from the earlier Catholic tradition on marriage and includes a discussion of the possibility of homosexual marriage.

Revised edition reviewed by James T. Bretzke, S.J. in *Catholic Studies: An Online Journal* (<http://www.adelphi.edu/cst>)

Horgan, John, ed. *Humanae Vitae and the Bishops*. Shannon: Irish University Press, 1972.

Contains reports of various bishops' conferences to *Humanae vitae*.

Kaiser, Robert Blair. *The Encyclical That Never Was: The Story of the Pontifical Commission on Population, Family and Birth, 1964-1966.* London: Sheed & Ward, 1985, 1987.

Initially published in the U.S.A. in 1985 under the title *The Politics of Sex and Religion.*

Journalistic style account of the origin and history of the work of the Pontifical Commission on Birth, first established by John XXIII and then augmented by Paul VI. Includes the so-called "majority report" which was presented to Paul VI, and discusses some of the reasons for the rejection of this report, and the drafting of the encyclical *Humanae vitae* which took an opposite tack.

Komonchak, Joseph A. "*Humanae vitae* and Its Reception: Ecclesiological Reflections." *Theological Studies* 39 (1978): 221-257.

Lawler, Michael G., and Salzman, Todd A. "The end of the affair? *Humanae Vitae* at 50: Document further fueled the post-World War II culture wars over the meaning of sexuality" *National Catholic Reporter* (May 21, 2018)
<https://www.ncronline.org/news/opinion/end-affair-humanae-vitae-50>

Focuses on the "human experience" sector of the Wesleyan Quadrilateral, and evaluates how this sector was used in the debates around contraception. The authors outline a number of problematic uses of "experience" in confusing correlation with causation, ignoring or underplaying cultural experiences, insufficient attention to the social sciences in relating systemic poverty to lack of ability to control the number of children and the like. "In conclusion, the affair *Humanae Vitae* introduced into the Catholic marital, ethical tradition in 1968 that "each and every marital act must of necessity retain its intrinsic relationship to the procreation of human life," has ended in 2018 with the conscientious and clear judgment of the people of God, instructed and validated by Pope Francis. The theological and cultural warriors can sheath their swords."

This essay is adapted from a journal article "Experience and Moral Theology: Reflections on *Humanae Vitae* forty years later," *INTAMS Review* 14 (2008).

Part of an ongoing series on "*Humanae vitae* at 50" published by the *National Catholic Reporter* at <https://www.ncronline.org/feature-series/humanae-vitae-at-50/stories> (accessed June 26, 2018)

At this writing Lawler is professor emeritus and Salzman is professor of theology at Creighton University in Omaha, NE.

López Trujillo, Alfonso Cardinal, and Archbishop Elio Sgreccia, eds. *Humanae Vitae. Servizio profetico per l'uomo. Atti del convegno di studi in occasione del XXV anniversario della enciclica Humanae Vitae, Roma 24-26 novembre 1993.* Roma: Anonima Veritas Editrice, 1995.

Malone, Richard. "*Humanae Vitae* revisited." *Communio* 15 (1988): 517-520.

Marengo, Gilfredo. *La Nascita di Un'enciclica: Humanae Vitae alla luce degli Archivi Vaticani*. Vatican City: Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 2018.

From the publisher (in Italian): Una ricerca storica sulla nascita di *Humanae vitae* – l'ultima enciclica di papa Paolo VI emanata il 25 luglio del 1968 – realizzata attraverso l'esame dei documenti presenti nell'Archivio della Sacra Congregazione per la Dottrina della Fede e nell'Archivio Segreto Vaticano. L'Autore ha ricostruito i modi e la lunga preparazione del documento magisteriale grazie alla lungimiranza di papa Francesco che ha concesso, in via del tutto straordinaria, l'accesso ai fondi archivistici relativi a *Humanae vitae*, facendo così eccezione alla norma legislativa che prevede l'apertura degli Archivi della Santa Sede agli studiosi solo dopo settanta anni.

Discussed in several places, including the blog of the ultra-conservative Sandro Magister under the title "*Humanae Vitae*." So It Was Born, and Woe To the One Who Touches It" at <http://magister.blogautore.espresso.repubblica.it/2018/07/18/humanae-vitae-so-it-was-born-and-woe-to-the-one-who-touches-it/> (published July 18, 2018)

Massa, Mark, S.J. *The Structure of Theological Revolutions: How the Fight Over Birth Control Transformed American Catholicism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018.

From the publisher's overview: Applies Thomas Kuhn's *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* to the Catholic theology and argues that Pope Paul VI's encyclical *Humanae Vitae* caused a paradigm shift in American Catholic thought. Questions the theological foundations of Catholic teachings on sexuality, birth control, gay marriage and abortion.

From the publisher's blurb: On July 29, 1968, Pope Paul VI ended years of discussion and study by Catholic theologians and bishops by issuing an encyclical on human sexuality and birth control entitled *Humanae Vitae*: "On Human Life." That document, which declared that "each and every marriage act must remain open to the transmission of life," led to widespread dissent and division within the Church, particularly in the United States. The divide that *Humanae Vitae* opened up is still with us today. Massa argues that American Catholics did not simply ignore and dissent from the encyclical's teachings on birth control, but that they also began to question the entire system of natural law theology that had undergirded Catholic thought since the days of Aquinas. Natural law is central to Catholic theology, as some of its most important teachings on issues such as birth control, marriage, and abortion rest on natural law arguments. Drawing inspiration from Thomas Kuhn's classic work *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*, Massa argues that *Humanae Vitae* caused a paradigm shift in American Catholic thought, one that has had far-reaching repercussions.

Massa is professor of historical theology at Boston College and Director of its Boisi Center for Religion and the Public Life.

May, William E. "Calming the Dissent: Understanding the Profound Message of *Humanae Vitae*." *Catholic Medical Quarterly* 44 (November 1993): 5-13.

May is Michael J. McGivney Professor of Moral Theology at the John Paul II Institute for Studies on Marriage and Family in Washington, D.C.

_____. "Church Teaching and Conscience." Chapter 8 in *Conscience: Readings in Moral Theology, 14*, 95-102. Edited by Charles E. Curran. New York: Paulist Press, 2004.

Originally appeared in *Why Humanae Vitae Was Right: A Reader*. Edited by Janet Smith. San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1993.

_____. "Humanae vitae, Natural Law and Catholic Moral Thought." In «*Humanae vitae*»: 20 anni dopo. *Atti del II Congresso Internazionale di Teologia Morale, Roma, 9-12 novembre 1988*, 43-72. Milano: Edizioni Ares, 1989.

Paper read at a congress supporting *Humanae vitae* sponsored by the John Paul II Pontifical Institute for the Study of Marriage and the Family (Lateran University) and two institutions of Opus Dei: Centro Accademico Romano della Santa Croce and the Università di Navarra.

McCormick, Richard A., S.J. "'Humanae Vitae' 25 Years Later." *America* 169 (17 July 1993): 6-8; 10-12.

_____. "A Response." *America* 169 (25 September 1993): 11-14.

McCormick's response to Kevin Flannery's and Joseph Koterski's "Paul VI Was Right" which is found in the same issue on pp. 7-11.

McMahon, Kevin. O.P. "'Humane Vitae': 25th Anniversary." *Origins* 22 (1993): 774-777.

McMahon articulates some of the major arguments against the acceptance of *Humanae vitae*, and then refutes these arguments. His statement of the dissenting views is fairly presented, though his counter-arguments would probably not change anyone's informed position on the issue.

Address given in a workshop on medical and moral issues sponsored by the Pope John XXIII Medical-Moral Research and Education Center, and held in Dallas from 1-5 February 1993.

Murphy, William F., Jr. "Revisiting Contraception: An Integrated Approach in Light of the Renewal of Thomistic Virtue Ethics." *Theological Studies* 72:4 (December 2011): 812-847.

Defending the work of Martin Rhonheimer, O.D. the author supports *Humanae vitae* and contends that all contraceptive acts are intrinsically evil.

Murphy received his STD from the Pope John Paul II Institute at the Catholic University

of America and is associate professor of moral theology at the Josephinum.

Murray, Paul. "The Power of *Humanae Vitae*: Take Another Look." *Commonweal* 121 (15 July 1994): 14-18.

Presents an 8-point positive view of *Humanae vitae*.

Murray is an elementary school teacher in Pocatello, Idaho, married with four children, and with his wife, Susan, a NFP instructor.

National Catholic Reporter. "Humanae vitae at 50." <https://www.ncronline.org/feature-series/humanae-vitae-at-50/stories> (accessed June 26, 2018)

A series of occasional essays by various theologians (mostly center-to-left) on aspects of *Humanae vitae* seen now a half-century after the Encyclical's release.

Newton, William. "Condoms and HIV: The State of the Debate." *Linacre Quarterly* 78 (February 2011): 29-44.

Looks at the *status quaestionis* of the debate over the moral legitimacy of using condoms with HIV discordant couples in light of the controversy ignited by Martin Rhonheimer, O.D.'s acceptance of this condom usage in his 2004 *Tablet* article. Newton indicates that a good part of the difficulty comes from the fact that Rhonheimer is "highly respected and doctrinally orthodox" yet holds a position that is considered heterodox by many other moralists who strongly support *Humanae vitae* such as Janet Smith, David Crawford, Benedict Guevin, O.S.B., and Stephen Long. After examining the various positions the author concludes that neither side has definitively proven its case and so we must await for a definitive statement by the Magisterium. Nevertheless, he argues that the "contraceptive choice" remains "intrinsically evil," but the disputed issue is whether condom usage of married HIV discordant couples represents "contraceptive choice" or not.

Newton is assistant professor at the International Theological Institute in Trumau, Austria and can be contacted at w.newton@iti.ac.at

Noonan, John T., Jr. *Contraception: A History of Its Treatment by the Catholic Theologians and Canonists*. Enlarged edition. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1965, 1986.

Encyclopedic study of the various notions and practices of contraception from pre-Christian times onwards. Noonan takes great care to investigate the social context of the various positions in order to demonstrate that while the "teaching" against contraception may have been "constant" in the Church, the reasons given for that teaching and the concomitant issues involved have changed very much throughout the centuries.

O'Rourke, Kevin, O.P. "*Humanae Vitae*, a 25-Year Retrospective." *Linacre Quarterly* 60

(November 1993): 76-80.

O'Rourke was Director of the Center for Health Care Ethics at the St. Louis University Medical Center until his death on March 28, 2012.

Rahner, Karl, S.J. "On the Encyclical *Humanae vitae*." In idem. *Theological Investigations*, vol. 9. London: Longman and Todd, 1974.

Rahner, Karl, S.J. and Häring, Bernard, C.Ss.R. "Zur Enzyklika «Humane vitae»." *Stimmen der Zeit* (1968): 193-210.

In italiano in Riflessioni sull'enciclica "Humanae vitae". Punti scottanti di teologia, 26. Roma: Edizioni Paoline, 1968.

Rhonheimer, Martin. "Contraception, Sexual Behavior, and Natural Law. Philosophical Foundations of the Norm of *Humanae vitae*." In «*Humanae vitae*»: 20 anni dopo. *Atti del II Congresso Internazionale di Teologia Morale, Roma, 9-12 novembre 1988*, 73-114. Milano: Edizioni Ares, 1989.

Paper read at a congress supporting *Humanae vitae* sponsored by the John Paul II Pontifical Institute for the Study of Marriage and the Family (Lateran University) and two institutions of Opus Dei: Centro Accademico Romano della Santa Croce and the Università di Navarra.

Also found in *Linacre Quarterly* 56 (1989).

Ruether, Rosemary Radford. "*Humanae Vitae* - Twenty-Five 32 Years Later." *Feminist Theology* 6 (May 1994): 11-14.

Schwab, C. "Morale protestante et morale catholique d'après Paul Tillich." *Etudes Théologiques et Religieuses* 64 (1989): 225-234.

Examines the position of Paul Tillich on the natural law, bringing into the conversation some contemporary Catholic texts taken *Humanae vitae*.

Selling, Joseph A. "Magisterial Teaching on Marriage, 1880-1968. Historical Constancy or Radical Development?" *Studia Moralia* 28 (1990): 439-490.

Also found in *Historia: Memoria Futuri. Mélanges Louis Vereecke (70^o anniversaire de naissance)*, 351-402. Edited by Réal Tremblay, C.Ss.R. and Dennis J. Billy, C.Ss.R. Roma: Editiones Academiae Alphonsianae, 1991.

By analyzing the teachings of Popes Leo XIII to Paul VI *Humane Vitae's* claim of the existence of a clearly definable body of teaching with respect to marriage which has been "constantly" taught by the Magisterium is evaluated. Selling concludes that a new norm, "openness to procreation" emerged which went "considerably beyond what Pius

XII had explicitly taught." *Humanae vitae* itself "can be better characterized either as a radical development in the line of teaching of Leo XIII, Pius XI and Pius XII, or a departure from the developing teaching of [these same popes] and the Second Vatican Council."

Selling taught moral theology on the Faculty of Theology at the Catholic University of Louvain. He also maintains the website www.christian-ethics.be.

_____. "Moral Teaching: Traditional Teaching and *Humanae vitae*." *Louvain Studies* 7 (1978): 24-44.

Article abstracted from Selling's 1977 dissertation done under Louis Janssens at the University of Louvain.

_____. "Overwriting tradition: *Humanae Vitae* replaced real church teaching." *National Catholic Reporter* (May 29, 2018) <https://www.ncronline.org/news/opinion/overwriting-tradition-humanae-vitae-replaced-real-church-teaching>

"The crisis visited upon conjugal morality after *Humanae Vitae*, and the failed renewal of moral theology after Vatican II, was not caused by any lack of attention to traditional teaching on the part of "some theologians" (*Veritatis Splendor*, 75). It was brought about by the introduction of non-traditional, inventive ideas as a substitute for the classical natural law approach, which had lost its ability to address issues in sexual morality. ... The real traditional teaching had been overwritten. The experience of the past 50 years seriously questions the success of that effort. At this point, what is important to realize is that if the teaching of *Humanae Vitae* is set aside, no damage whatsoever will have been done to the real traditional teaching. If the current occupant of the papal office takes that step, he will have confirmed that the purpose of tradition itself is to move forward, not backward."

Part of an ongoing series on "*Humanae vitae* at 50" published by the *National Catholic Reporter* at <https://www.ncronline.org/feature-series/humanae-vitae-at-50/stories> (accessed June 26, 2018)

_____. "Regulating Fertility and Clarifying Moral Language." *Heythrop Journal* (2014).

Using the evolving Church teaching on the moral licitness of regulating fertility by married couples Selling outlines several differing modes of moral reasoning and analysis employed in the various teachings, and raises significant problems associated with an insufficiently nuanced understanding of terms such as "intrinsically evil/immoral." He illustrates his discussion by using examples from Augustine to John Paul II, and focuses especially on the development of moral reasoning from Pius XI's 1931 *Casti Connubii* to Pius XII's 1951 Address to the Italian Midwives, to Vatican II's 1965 *Gaudium et spes* and then on to Paul VI's 1968 *Humanae vitae* before concluding with John Paul II's employment of terms such as "culture of life" and "culture of death" in his 1995 *Evangelium vitae* and elsewhere.

Smith, Janet E. *Humanae Vitae: A Generation Later*. Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press, 1991.

Discusses the controversy over the Encyclical from both a theological and philosophical point of view.

Smith taught philosophy at the University of Dallas and is now professor of moral theology at Sacred Heart Seminary in Detroit.

_____. "The *Munus* of Transmitting Human Life: A New Approach to *Humanae Vitae*." *The Thomist* 54 (1990): 385-427.

Smith, Janet E., ed. *Why Humanae Vitae Was Right: A Reader*. San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1993.

22 essays defending *Humanae Vitae*, including a new annotated translation of the Encyclical itself. Authors include Paul Quay, Dietrich Von Hildebrand, G.E.M. Anscombe, John Finnis, Carlo Caffarra, John Kippley, William E. May, and Smith herself, who also provides her own translation of *Humanae Vitae* and an introduction to each essay. The articles focus frequently on the "anthropological ground" of the assertion that each act of intercourse must remain inseparably unitive and procreative.

Smith, Msgr. William B. "The Role of the Christian Family, Articles 28-35 [of *Familiaris Consortio; Gaudium et Spes; Humanae Vitae*]." In *Pope John Paul II and the Family*, 73-107. Edited by M. Wrenn. 1983.

Msgr. William B. Smith is an Opus Dei theologian who teaches moral theology at Dunwoodie, NY, and for many years wrote the Question/Answer column on moral matters for *Homiletic and Pastoral Review*.

Thiel, John E. . "Tradition and Authoritative Reasoning." *Theological Studies* 56 (1995): 627-651.

Uses insights from nonfoundational epistemology to discuss some of the problematic relations between argument and authority in magisterial teaching. Teachings contained in Paul VI's *Humanae vitae* (against artificial contraception) and *Inter Insigniores* (against women's ordination) are used to illustrate the issue.

Thiel is professor of theology at Fairfield University.

Tentler, Leslie Woodcock. *Catholics and Contraception: An American History*. Cushwagh Center Studies of Catholicism in Twentieth-Century America. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2004.

Tentler concentrates on the lay people in the American pews and the priests in the pulpits

and confessionals from a period which commences with the nearly unanimous opposition to birth control by religious leaders in the late nineteenth century and concludes with the period of the initial reaction, and large-scale rejection which the American Catholic laity accorded to Paul VI's 1968 Encyclical *Humanae vitae* which reaffirmed the unconditional ban on artificial contraception. Along the way Tentler shows the larger forces of cultural change and the development of mores which would impact views of sex and sexuality beyond simply the contraception question/issue. Her work brings together an incredible amount of research into the archives of dioceses and religious orders, especially those who preached the once popular parish missions which were a bulwark of support for the Church's position on birth control. This archival research is augmented by a considerable number of interviews conducted with American clergy who were ordained prior to 1960. The book concludes with a riveting account of the role played by John Ford, S.J. as a *peritus* at Vatican II, and his behind-the-scenes efforts to thwart the Pontifical Birth Control Commission's majority report which had called for a change in the Church's absolute opposition to birth control. Tentler shows, though, that Ford's victory with the publication of *Humanae vitae* had the opposite effect of what he expected, since the resulting fallout did not prevent American Catholics' practice of birth control from mirroring that of the general population and exacerbated a significant decline in the obedience and respect given to the Church's hierarchical authority.

Tentler is professor of history at The Catholic University of America.

Reviewed by James T. Bretzke, S.J. in *Catholic Studies: An Online Journal* <http://CatholicBooksRevue.org>, and by Patrick Hayes in *Theological Studies* 66 (December 2005): 915-917.

Tettamanzi, Msgr. [later Cardinal] Dionigi. *Un'enciclica profetica: La Humanae vitae vent'anni dopo*. Milano: Ancora, 1988.

Collection of Tettamanzi's articles which have appeared in *L'Osservatore Romano*.

Theron, Stephen. "Natural Law in *Humanae vitae*." In «*Humanae vitae*»: 20 anni dopo. *Atti del II Congresso Internazionale di Teologia Morale, Roma, 9-12 novembre 1988*, 487-496. Milano: Edizioni Ares, 1989.

Paper read at a congress supporting *Humanae vitae* sponsored by the John Paul II Pontifical Institute for the Study of Marriage and the Family (Lateran University) and two institutions of Opus Dei: Centro Accademico Romano della Santa Croce and the Università di Navarra.

Valsecchi, Ambrogio. *Controversy: The Birth Control Debate 1958-1968*. Introduction by Gregory Baum. Translated by Dorothy White. Washington, D.C.: Corpus Books, 1968. Originally published in Italian as *Regolazione delle nascite. Un decennio di riflessioni teologiche*. Brescia: Queriniana, 1967.

This is an excellent book which synthesizes and documents the wide range of theological

and ecclesiastical opinions regarding the *status quaestionis* regarding the possible moral legitimacy of contraception. It should be noted that the original Italian version of the book was published in 1967, prior to the promulgation of Pope Paul VI's Encyclical *Humanae vitae* (which is included as an Appendix to the English version).

You, Alain. *La loi de gradualité: une nouveauté en morale? Fondements théologiques et applications.* Paris: Editions P. Lethielleux, 1991.

Analyzes the principle of gradualism in terms of the magisterial teaching as well as some of the debate around *Humanae vitae* and *Familiaris consortio*. Reviewed by Sabatino Majorano, C.Ss.R. in *Studia Moralia* 29 (1991): 488-492.